

Rec'd 7/26/05



THE PORT AUTHORITY OF NY & NJ

July 20, 2005

Francis J. Lombardi, P.E.
Chief Engineer

Dr. Shyam Sunder
Acting Deputy Director
Building and Fire Research Laboratory
National Institute of Standards and Technology
100 Bureau Drive, Stop 100
Gaithersburg, MD 20899-1000

SUBJECT: NIST Draft Report of WTC Collapse – 4th Stair Issue for Places of Assembly

Dear Dr. Sunder:

The draft report prepared by NIST has the following incorrect and misleading statement, in the 4th paragraph on page 58 of NCSTAR1, regarding code interpretation and the need for a 4th exit from Windows on the World and Top of the World that is not factual:

“Subsequently, NIST communications in 2005 with the Port Authority and the NYC Department of Buildings identified a difference of interpretation regarding the number of exits required to serve these floors. The Port Authority stated that a 4th exit was not required since the assembly use space in question constituted less than 20 percent of the area of principal use, with principal use area defined as the entire building.”

The statement does not represent the Port Authority's written response to questions from NIST regarding the applicability of the concept of areas of refuge and the need for a 4th stair, as evidenced in the attached copy of the communication.


The fact remains that the Port Authority reached out to the NYC Department of Buildings for code interpretation and requirements with respect to egress from Windows on the World. The Registered Architect of Record interpreted the code; the PA did not. The egress from Windows was presented to the Department of Buildings and they concurred with the design.

The statement in the draft report should be corrected in the final report to accurately represent the facts.

I would like to commend NIST's National Construction Safety Team for the extensive technical work and in-depth analysis done in the investigation of the World Trade Center collapse. The draft final report presents unprecedented technical details and demonstrates the high level of technical expertise of the Investigation Team.

The Port Authority is presently going through the draft of the complete report and any further comments will be forwarded to you before the August 4th deadline.

Sincerely,


Francis J. Lombardi, P. E.
Chief Engineer

Attachment

233 Park Avenue South, 7th floor
New York, NY 10003
T: 212-435-7449 F: 212-435-6689

Bhol, Saroj

From: Shyam Sunder [sunder@nist.gov]
Sent: Friday, May 06, 2005 10:32 AM
To: Bhol, Saroj
Subject: Re: Exits for Assembly Use Spaces

Saroj: Thanks. Shyam

At 09:02 AM 5/6/2005, you wrote:

Shyam,
Here's the response to the questions in the attachment.
Thanks
Saroj

(The numbers relate to the questions)

1. PA reaches out to the NYC Department of Buildings (DOB) for code clarifications and interpretations. Based on PA's meeting on exits from the Windows on the World with the DOB on December 6, 1994, it's PA's understanding that "20% of the floor area" in section 27-367 is intended to be the total floor area in the building occupied by the principal use.
2. There are no other section in the code on exit reduction beside section 27-367.
3. During the meeting with the DOB, the need for a fourth stair did not arise.

-----Original Message-----

From: Shyam Sunder [mailto:sunder@nist.gov]
Sent: Monday, May 02, 2005 1:19 PM
To: Bhol, Saroj
Cc: rbukowski@nist.gov; jason.averill@nist.gov; james.lawson@nist.gov; cauffman@nist.gov; cheri.Sawyer@nist.gov
Subject: Exits for Assembly Use Spaces

Saroj,

Attached is a request for information/clarification regarding the numbers of exist required for the assembly use spaces at the top of the WTC towers. Please be advised that NIST has not made a determination whether the WTC towers required four stairwells as a result of these spaces. We would appreciate your response in the near future.

Shyam

Dr. S. Shyam Sunder
Acting Deputy Director
Building and Fire Research Laboratory
National Institute of Standards and Technology
Gaithersburg, MD 20899-8600
Tel.: 301-975-6850; Fax: 301-975-4032

7/8/2005

Number of Exits Required in the Assembly Use Areas of the WTC Towers

All of the building codes examined in this study contain nearly identical requirements for Means of Egress, so this discussion will focus on the (1968) New York City Building Code (NYCBC). The building code (27-366) requires that every floor shall have "... *at least two independent exits, remote from each other ...*" except for one and two family dwellings and certain group J (multifamily residential) buildings. Subparagraph 3 of this section states further that,

"Notwithstanding any other provision of this section, when, within a building, any place of assembly has an occupant load between five hundred and nine hundred ninety-nine persons, there shall be provided at least three independent exits, remote from each other, from each floor; any such place of assembly with an occupant load of one thousand or more persons shall be provided with at least four independent exits, remote from each other, from each floor (emphasis added)."

However the next section provides for reductions in the number of exits required as follows:

"27-367 Exit reduction - When a floor area has access to areas of refuge that comply with the requirements of section 27-372 of article five of this subchapter, the number of persons for whom vertical exits are to be provided may be reduced to fifty percent of the occupant load of the floor area when one area of refuge is provided, and may be reduced to thirty-three percent of the floor area when two areas of refuge are provided. This section shall not be applicable to any new or altered place of assembly, except for such places of assembly in fully sprinklered office buildings which occupy less than twenty percent of the floor area occupied by the principal use (emphasis added)."

For the office floors the occupant load was no more than 390 and only two exits (providing a minimum of 6 ½ units of exit width, total) were required. Three exits providing a total of 6 ½ units of exit width were present.

For Windows on the World (floors 106 and 107 in WTC 1), however, the occupant loads were 1,013 and 1,130 respectively and the capacity of the stairs was increased to 1,170 by the creation of three areas of refuge, arranged in accordance with the requirements of section 27-372. Similarly for Top of the World (floor 107 in WTC 2) the occupant load calculated by the code required method was 1,751, but was limited to the 1,170 stair capacity (permitted by the creation of three areas of refuge) by order of The Port Authority and enforced by the tenant.

Applying the NYCBC provisions to Windows on the World and Top of the World:

- 27-366 (3) calls for four independent exits, except as modified by the next section.
- 27-367 does not appear to be applicable since all three floors were altered places of assembly (they had been renovated after the 1993 bombing) and:
 - The buildings do not appear to have been fully sprinklered in 1995.

- It appears the buildings were fully sprinklered by September 11, 2001 (as late as 1999 the sprinkler system being installed on the skylobby floors). However, the places of assembly occupied more than twenty percent of the floor area occupied by the principal use on those floors (which was assembly use).

Questions for the Port Authority of New York and New Jersey:

1. How does the PANYNJ interpret above sections 27-366 and 27-367 of the New York City Building Code?
2. Are there other sections of the New York City Building Code that would have allowed a different interpretation regarding the number of exits required?
3. On what basis does the PANYNJ conclude that a fourth exit was not required?